

HISTORIC RESOURCES COMMISSION MINUTES

Thursday, October 17, 2019

4:00 p.m.

111 N. Front Street, Room 204

Commissioners Present: Clyde Henry (Chairperson), Steward Gibboney, Joseph McCabe,
Dan Morgan; Erin Prosser

Commissioners Absent: Jackie Barton

City Staff Present: Connie Torbeck

- I. CALL TO ORDER – 4:04 p.m.
- II. NEXT COMMISSION MONTHLY BUSINESS MEETING – 12:00 p.m. (Noon), Thursday, November 14, 2019 – 111 N. Front Street (Michael B. Coleman Government Center); Third Floor, Room 313
- III. NEXT COMMISSION HEARING – 4:00 p.m., Thursday, November 21, 2019 – 111 N. Front Street (Michael B. Coleman Government Center); Room 204 (Hearing Room)
- IV. SWEAR IN OF STAFF
- V. INTRODUCTION OF COMMISSIONERS PRESENT
- VI. APPROVAL OF MINUTES, Thursday, September 19, 2018.
MOTION: McCabe/Prosser (4-0-1[Gibboney-abstain]) APPROVED
- VII. STAFF APPROVALS – The Historic Resources Commission hereby accepts all Staff Approved items, as listed, (see below), and enters them into the formal record. Abstentions (if any) are shown in brackets immediately following the specific application.
MOTION: McCabe/Prosser (5-0-0) APPROVED
- VIII. PUBLIC FORUM
- IX. APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS

1. HR-19-10-015

271-277 South Champion Avenue

Able Roof (Applicant)

Following presentation of the staff report, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.

In the absence of the Applicant, continue Application # HR-19-10-015, 271-277 South Champion Avenue, Bryden Road Historic District, for removal of the slate roof and installation of new asphalt shingle roof, to allow Applicant time to submit additional required information, and direct Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the November 21, 2019 Historic Resources Commission agenda for further review.

MOTION: Gibboney/ McCabe (5-0-0) CONTINUED

Bryden Road Historic District

Hailu, Yeshashwork & Selemrn (Owner)



CONTINUED APPLICATIONS

2. HR-19-09-021

696 South Champion Avenue

Old Oaks Historic District

Melanie Cole (Applicant/Owner)

Window schedule for new, wood, awning-type basement windows was submitted following the October 10, 2019 business meeting. A staff approval to install new basement windows has been issued.

NO ACTION REQUIRED.

3. HR-19-09-022a

2070-2072 Indianola Avenue

Iuka Ravine Historic District

Nick Nicastro (Applicant)

2064 Indianola LLC (Owner)

Following presentation of the staff report, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.

In the absence of, and at the request of the Applicant, continue Application # HR-19-09-022a, 2070-2072 Indianola Avenue, Iuka Ravine Historic District, for installation of glass block basement level windows, and direct Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the November 21, 2019 Historic Resources Commission agenda for further review.

MOTION: McCabe/Gibboney (5-0-0) CONTINUED

4. HR-19-09-028

774 Bedford Avenue

Old Oaks Historic District

Mitchell Levine (Applicant/Owner)

This application was reviewed and continued from the September 19, 2019 HRC hearing to allow time for the Applicant to submit revised drawings. Applicant requests to be removed from the agenda until further notice.

Submittal of a new application will be required to be placed on a future agenda.

Enclose Rear Deck

- Enclose the first story of the non-historic, two-story deck on the rear elevation.
- Exterior cladding to be vertical, wood siding, similar to existing garage siding.
- Wood windows to be from the approved windows list.
- Paint first and second stories.

REMOVED FROM AGENDA. NO ACTION REQUIRED.

5. HR-19-09-025b

642 Linwood Avenue

Old Oaks Historic District

Rob Ruhl Contracting (Applicant)

Bill Hayes (Owner)

Following presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.

Approve Application HR-19-09-025b, 642 Linwood Avenue, Old Oaks Historic District, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

Modify Existing New Windows

- Retain the existing lower sashes, and replace the existing upper sashes of the twenty-eight (28) JeldWen, premium wood, double-hung, sash-pack sash replacement windows, as installed prior to review and approval.
- New upper sashes to be JeldWen W-2500, simulated divided lite sashes, with 7/8" Putty muntins permanently affixed to the interior and exterior, and a spacer bar between the two layers of glass, per the submitted product cut sheet.
- New six-over-one and eight-over-one, aluminum-clad wood sashes replace original, wood, six-over-one and eight-over-one sashes.
- All original, wood, six-light, casement windows to be retained and repaired, as needed.

MOTION: McCabe/Prosser (5-0-0) APPROVED

NEW APPLICATIONS

6. HR-19-10-016

1610-1612 Bryden Road

Bryden Road Historic District

Amy Lauerhaus/ Lauerhaus Architecture (Applicant)

KMS South Holdings, LLC. (Owner)

Upon review of Application #19-3-15, 1169 Bryden Road, Bryden Road Historic District, the Historic Resources Commission recommends approval of the proposed variances, as submitted:

Request for Variance Recommendation

1) 3332.035: R-3 Residential District

R-3 does not permit 3-unit dwellings

Request to allow three (3) dwelling units in the existing two (2) family dwelling.

2) 3312.49: Minimum Numbers of Parking Spaces Required

To reduce the number of parking spaces required from 6 to 3

3) 3332.05(A)(4): Area District Lot Width Requirements (Existing Condition)

Lot is required to be 50.0' wide whereas the existing lot is 39.0'

4) 3332.13: R-3 Area District Requirements (Existing Condition)

In an R-3 area district a principal building shall be situated on a lot of no less than 5,000 sf in area

Using 3332.18(C) in an R-3 district, if the depth of a lot is more than three times the width of such lot, a depth of only three times such width shall be used in computing density.

3X lot width = 39.0' x 3 = 117' 117' x 39' = 4563 sf Lot Area

5) 3332.26(B): Minimum Side Yard Permitted (Existing Condition)

In R-3 districts = five feet; except that on a lot 40 feet wide or less, the least dimension shall be no less than three feet.

The Minimum Side Yard of the Current Building is 1.4'

6) 3332.26(F): Minimum Side Yard Permitted (Existing Condition)

Where a building exceeds two and one-half stories in height, the minimum side yard shall be not less than one-sixth of the height of the building

Building Height = 29.2' / 6 = 4.86'

The Minimum Side Yard of the Current Building is 1.4'

Reasons for Recommendation

- The purview of the Historic Resources Commission is to review the effect of projects on exterior historic character.
- The requested variances will not require any historic alterations to the building or lot, i.e., no new exterior stairs, no window converted to a door, no new door openings, no large parking pad or stacked parking.

MOTION: McCabe/Morgan (5-0-0) RECOMMEND APPROVAL

7. HR-19-10-017

1445 Summit Street

Steven Schwope/New Avenue Architects (Applicant)

Orton Memorial Lab/Individually Listed Property

ACUHO-I Management, LLC (Owner)

Following presentation by the Applicant, Application # HR-19-10-017 was divided into Items 'a' and 'b' for clarity of action. Motions were made, votes taken, and results recorded as indicated.

HR-19-10-017a

Approve Application # HR-19-10-017a, 1445 Summit Street, Orton Memorial Lab/Individually Listed Property, as modified with any/all clarifications noted:

New Parking Lot Screening Design

- Install new fence on the south side of existing parking lot, along Eighth Avenue, per the submitted drawing, with the following modifications to the fence design:
 - Remove the two inner, metal squares. Retain the large, outermost metal squares and the "X".
 - Metal mesh is to cover the large metal squares, with only the outer rectangular areas being open.
 - Center medallion to be retained.
- Revised drawing to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Note: COA# HR-19-10-017a modifies COA# 18-9-1 and 17-1-5b.

MOTION: Gibboney/Morgan (5-0-0) APPROVED

HR-19-10-017b

Continue Application # HR-19-10-017b, 1445 Summit Street, Orton Memorial Lab/Individually Listed Property, for a variance recommendation, and direct Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the November 21, 2019 Historic Resources Commission agenda for further review.

MOTION: McCabe/Prosser (5-0-0) CONTINUED

8. HR-19-10-018

146 East Northwood Avenue

George Kanellopoulos (Applicant/Owner)

Northwood Park Historic District

Following presentation by representative of the Applicant, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.

Continue Application # HR-19-10-018, 146 East Northwood Avenue, Northwood Park Historic District, in regard to a demolished garage, and direct Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the November 21, 2019 Historic Resources Commission agenda for further review.

Commissioner Comments

- Historic garages should be maintained and rebuilt if damaged beyond repair. Any garages in poor condition should be reported to Code Enforcement.
- The best result would be to build a new garage, in-like-kind.
- For the Commission to consider any alternative to rebuilding the garage, a more detailed site plan would be required, including the fence, landscaping, and design details.
- If a garage is not built, the parking pad design should be something special.
- No matter how damage occurs to a property, the guidelines still need to be followed.

MOTION: Morgan/Gibboney (5-0-0) CONTINUED

9. HR-19-10-020

726 South Champion Avenue

Old Oaks Historic District

Crispin Alvarez (Applicant/Owner)

Following presentation by the representative of the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.

Approve Application HR-19-10-020, 726 South Champion Avenue, Old Oaks Historic District, as modified with any/all clarifications noted:

Create New Window Opening

- Remove the existing, non-original, west-facing door opening located on the bay that extends from the south elevation of the house.
- Non-original door opening to be replaced with a window opening.
- New window opening to be the same size and design as the existing original window opening (located south of the main front entrance doorway) on the first floor of the façade.
- All exterior, wood window sill, casings, and crown molding to match existing windows.
- New window to be from the approved windows list, as provided by Historic Preservation Office staff.

Note: A new window opening appears appropriate and is being approved because no photos were located showing whether a window or just siding was originally located on the west side of the bay.

MOTION: McCabe/Gibboney (5-0-0) APPROVED

10. HR-19-10-022

100 East Arcadia Avenue

North High School / Individually Listed Property

Kyle Carpenter/Abbot Studios (Applicant)

Board of Education Columbus City School District (Owner)

Following presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.

Approve Application HR-19-10-022, 100 East Arcadia Avenue, North High School / Individually Listed Property, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

Install New Windows

- Remove all non-original windows on the façade (south), east, and west elevations, per the submitted drawings, and product cut sheets.
- New window design to be based on original architectural drawings, as provided.
- Replace stone lintels where existing lintels are damaged.

Masonry Repair

- Perform Dutchman stone repairs where partial loss of stone has occurred.
- Replace areas of stone where cracked or eroded, per the submitted detailed work description.
- Replace brick where majority of surface has spalled.
- Clean soiled stone and brick surfaces, per submitted specifications.
- Remove all non-original and inappropriate mortar, as needed.
- Repoint brick and stone, as needed, per submitted specifications.

New EPDM Roof

- Remove existing roofing system, and install new EPDM roofing system.

MOTION: McCabe/Gibboney (5-0-0) APPROVED

CONCEPTUAL REVIEW

11. HR-19-10-023

602 East Town Street

David Blair/Shremshock Architects (Applicant)

**East Town Street Historic District
Joe Collins Property, LLC (Owner)**

Demolition

- Demolish the existing carriage house at the rear of the property.

Addition/New Construction

- Retain the existing, brick apartment building, as is.
- Build new, three-story addition at the rear of the existing apartment building. To be separated from existing by breezeway and stairs.
- Proposed new 24 units to be walk-up flats.
- Materials include dark brick adjacent to rear wing of existing building with clapboard
- To include 14 new surface parking spaces and 4 new interior parking spaces.
- Exterior cladding to include masonry and composite clapboard siding.
- Includes removal of existing Town Street curb cut and entry driveway.

Following presentation by the Applicant, Vice-Chairperson Morgan opened the discussion and Commission members offered comments to the applicants:

Commissioner Comments

Commissioner McCabe:

- The proposed massing appears appropriate.
- Final details should include all exterior materials.
- Exterior materials should be simple but high quality.
- There are a lot of red, brown, and other dark colors on other buildings along the alley.

Commissioner Prosser:

- The exterior materials should be subservient to the existing, main building.
- Removing the one curb cut on E Rich Street is a positive move.

Commissioner Morgan:

- The proposed addition is a simple, plain block of a building. It is like a new, separate building on its own with little relationship to the existing building.
- The alley-scape could use a punch of color.
- The design could use some subtle changes – something slightly special.
- Consider pulling some details from the existing apartment building.

Commissioner Gibboney:

- The overall design and materials must be respectful to the neighborhood.

NO ACTION TAKEN

12. HR-19-10-024

626-628 Wilson Avenue

Old Oaks Historic District

J. Enterprises Construction, Inc. c/o Lachelle Lane (Applicant) Compuname LLC (Owner)

Following presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.

Approve Application HR-19-10-024, 626-628 Wilson Avenue, Old Oaks Historic District, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

Build New Garage

- Build new, frame, 24' x 24', two-car garage, at rear of lot, per the submitted drawings.
- Exterior cladding to be HardieBoard, smooth, horizontal siding.

- Roofing material to be asphalt shingles from the approved roofing shingles list. Metal ridge roll required.
- All trim to be per the Columbus Register of Historic Properties Architectural Guidelines, page 85.
- Cut sheets for the pedestrian door, overhead doors, windows, and exterior light fixtures to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for review and approval, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Build New Rear Stoops / Rear Elevation

- Remove the two (2) existing, deteriorated concrete stoops on the rear elevation.
- Build two (2) new stoops with shed roofs, per the submitted drawings.
- Railings to be per the Columbus Register of Historic Properties Architectural Guidelines, page 15.

MOTION: McCabe/Gibboney (5-0-0) APPROVED

STAFF APPROVALS

• **HR-19-10-001**

2088-2090 Tuller Street

Andrew J. Delzoppo (Applicant)

Approve Application HR-19-10-001, 2088-2090 Tuller Street, Indianola Forest Historic District, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

Install Exhaust Vent

- Install new restroom and dryer exhaust vents, as needed, per all applicable code, per the submitted photographs.

Relocate Electrical Service

- Relocate any/all electrical wires and cables currently located on the rear elevation of the house, as needed, per all applicable code, per the submitted photographs.

Indianola Forest Historic District

Inn Town Holdings II, LLC. (Owner)

• **HR-19-10-002**

686 South Champion Avenue

Daniel Winks (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application HR-19-10-002, 686 South Champion Avenue, Old Oaks Historic District, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

Install New Doors

- Retain the existing, new, multi-light, French doors, on the rear elevation, as installed.
- New doors replace vandalized, non-contributing doors within a non-original doorway opening.
- Install new wood trim to match trim profile on main house. Paint to match existing colors.

Old Oaks Historic District

• **HR-19-10-003**

51 Jefferson Avenue

Katharine Moore (Applicant)

Approve Application HR-19-10-003, 51 Jefferson Avenue, Jefferson Avenue Historic District, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

Repair Masonry Chimney

- Remove all defective material. Replace any/all damaged and missing brick with brick that matches the original material in size, shape, color, and texture.
- New mortar must be no harder than the historic mortar to allow for expansion and contraction of the masonry. Original mortar mix was composed of 1 part lime to 2 parts sand. White portland cement may be substituted for up to (but no more than) 20 percent of the lime content. (The owner is advised to use the approved 12 parts sand-4 parts lime-1 part white portland cement formula approved by the National Trust For Historic Preservation. Please refer to Preservation Brief 2- "Repointing Mortar in Historic Masonry Buildings" <http://www.nps.gov/tps/how-to-preserve/briefs/2-repoint-mortar-joints.htm>).

Jefferson Avenue Historic District

Jefferson Center for Learning & the Arts (Owner)

• **HR-19-10-004**

57 Jefferson Avenue

Katharine Moore (Applicant)

Jefferson Avenue Historic District

Jefferson Center for Learning & the Arts (Owner)

Approve Application HR-19-10-004, 57 Jefferson Avenue, Jefferson Avenue Historic District, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

Repair Masonry Chimneys

- Repair the three (3) existing chimneys, as needed.
- Remove all defective material. Replace any/all damaged and missing brick with brick that matches the original material in size, shape, color, and texture.
- New mortar must be no harder than the historic mortar to allow for expansion and contraction of the masonry. Original mortar mix was composed of 1 part lime to 2 parts sand. White portland cement may be substituted for up to (but no more than) 20 percent of the lime content. (The owner is advised to use the approved 12 parts sand-4 parts lime-1 part white portland cement formula approved by the National Trust For Historic Preservation. Please refer to Preservation Brief 2- "Repointing Mortar in Historic Masonry Buildings" <http://www.nps.gov/tps/how-to-preserve/briefs/2-repoint-mortar-joints.htm>).

Remove Existing Sidewalk and Install New Sidewalk

- Remove existing, deteriorated, concrete, public sidewalk, per submitted photographs, and dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Install new concrete in the same location and of the same dimension, as needed.
- All work to be in accordance with industry standards and all applicable City Building Codes.
- Maintain any/all existing sandstone curbs, and repair, as needed, in accordance with all applicable industry standards, and/or replace with like sandstone curbing.

• **HR-19-10-005**

61 Jefferson Avenue

Katharine Moore (Applicant)

Jefferson Avenue Historic District

Jefferson Center for Learning & the Arts (Owner)

Approve Application HR-19-10-005, 61 Jefferson Avenue, Jefferson Avenue Historic District, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

Remove Existing Sidewalk and Install New Sidewalk

- Remove existing, deteriorated, concrete, public sidewalk, per submitted photographs, and dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Install new concrete in the same location and of the same dimension, as needed.
- All work to be in accordance with industry standards and all applicable City Building Codes.
- Maintain any/all existing sandstone curbs, and repair, as needed, in accordance with all applicable industry standards, and/or replace with like sandstone curbing.

• **HR-19-10-006**

734 Kimball Place

Pam Kinzy/Able Roof (Applicant)

Old Oaks Historic District

James Lynn (Owner)

Approve Application HR-19-10-006, 734 Kimball Place, Old Oaks Historic District, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

Install New Rubber Roof

- Remove any/all asphalt shingles or rolled roofing on the roof of the two-story, frame, rear addition, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Examine all structural members of the low-slope roofing system from the square (i.e. top plate) to determine condition. Make any/all necessary structural repairs as needed in accordance with standard building practices and all applicable Columbus Building Codes.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing/decking with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.

- Install new E. P. D. M. rubber in accordance with all applicable industry standards, manufacturer's specifications, and Columbus Building Codes regarding installation of flat roof coverings. Color to be "Black."
- Replace any/all deteriorated and damaged wood fascia with new wood of same dimension as necessary. Prime and finish coat all wood fascia prior to the installation of all new gutter and down spouts; color to match the existing trim color.

• **HR-19-10-007**

200 East Oakland Avenue

Northwood Park Historic District

Richard Schnipke (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application HR-19-10-007, 200 East Oakland Avenue, Northwood Park Historic District, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

Install New AC Condenser

- Install new air conditioner condenser unit in rear yard, on a new concrete pad, at the southwest corner of the house, per the submitted site plan.

Note: Unit is to be located at the rear elevation of the house and will be not visible from any public right-of-way. No additional screening is required.

• **HR-19-10-008**

633 Linwood Avenue

Old Oaks Historic District

Michael P. Herman (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application HR-19-10-008, 633 Linwood Avenue, Old Oaks Historic District, for renewal of expired COA # 18-2-5a (Expired: February 6, 2019) & 18-2-5b (Expired: February 12, 2019), exactly as previously approved, for a period of one (1) year.

Install New Windows

- Install new aluminum-clad, wood windows to fit the size of existing openings, per the submitted drawings.
- Cut sheet/specifications for the new windows to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, in consultation with the Historic Resources Commission, prior to installation.

Convert Window Opening to Door Opening

- Convert the existing, blocked-in window opening to a new door opening, per the submitted drawing, to allow access to a new interior stair to the existing second floor.
- Cut sheet/specifications for the new door to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, in consultation with the Historic Resources Commission, prior to installation.

Note: Aluminum-clad wood windows are being approved based on the Amendments to City of Columbus Architectural Review Commission Guidelines, approved by the HRC on 12/18/2003, and adopted by City Council as Ordinance # 2221-2004 on 7/25/2005, i.e., "An aluminum clad wood window or vinyl clad wood window may be considered if the size, profile, operation, and proportion match the contributing window."

Note: Modification of an existing window opening to a door opening is being approved based on the following: 1) Access to the second story is required; 2) Modification of the existing, blocked-in window opening to a door opening to provide access to an interior stairway is the least intrusive means of adding second story access.

Carriage House Finish Treatments

- Entry Door—Pella 'Craftsman Light Entry Door w/Glass
- Stoop and Canopy at New Entry Door
- Loft Door on Rear/West Elevation
- Install Sun Tunnels or Ganged Skylights in Roof

• **HR-19-10-009**

1810 Bryden Road

Bryden Road Historic District

Lisa Van Dyke (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application HR-19-10-009, 1810 Bryden Road, Bryden Road Historic District, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

Exterior Painting & Trim Repair/Replacement

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as needed, per the submitted specifications. All replacement Boral trim to be of same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the brick house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wooden surfaces and new Boral trim with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Paint color palette to be per the submitted paint color chips.
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., exterior brick walls; stone window and door sills and lintels; tone coping on front porch railing; stone foundation) is to remain unpainted.**

• **HR-19-10-010**

57 Riverview Park Drive

Old Beechwold Historic District

Laurie Stein Marsh (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application HR-19-10-010, 57 Riverview Park Drive, Old Beechwold Historic District, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as needed. All replacement wood to be of same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wooden surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Paint color palette to be per the submitted paint color chips: Stucco – "Sail Cloth"; Overhang & Fascia, Trim, Garage Door, and Window/Door Casings – "Smoky Ash"; Windows – "Bittersweet Chocolate"; Front & Side Door – "Deep Caviar."
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry is to remain unpainted.**

• **HR-19-10-011**

29 North Garfield Avenue (750 East Broad St. Parking Lot)

Hamilton Park Historic District

Maria Andersen (Applicant)

Brian E. Higgins (Owner)

Approve Application HR-19-10-011, 29 North Garfield Avenue (750 East Broad St. Parking Lot), Hamilton Park Historic District, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

Parking Lot Improvements

- Install new perimeter parking screening, including shrubs and trees, per the submitted drawings.
- Remove the eastern curb cut along N. Garfield Avenue, per the submitted site plan. All work to be in consultation with the Department of Public Service.
- Install new transformer on concrete pad at the southeast corner of N. Garfield Avenue and Avon Place, per the submitted site plan.
- Install new pedestrian accessible sidewalk/ramp at the southeast corner of N. Garfield Avenue and Avon Place, per the submitted site plan. All work to be in consultation with the Department of Public Service.

Note: Parking lot area south of Avon Place is not within the boundaries of Hamilton Park Historic District, and does not require review and approval from the Historic Resources Commission.

• **HR-19-10-012**

46 West Beechwold Blvd.

Old Beechwold Historic District

Pro Exterior by APCO (Applicant)

Bill & Christina Kemp (Owner)

Approve Application HR-19-10-012, 46 West Beechwold Blvd., Old Beechwold Historic District, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

Remove Aluminum Siding/Install Hardie Siding

- Remove the existing, non-original, non-contributing aluminum siding and the damaged/deteriorated wood siding beneath.
- Dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Install new, James Hardie smooth, 7" lap siding to match the original wood siding profile and dimension; like-for-like. Color to be "Evening Blue."
- Install new Hardie Trim smooth corner boards, frieze boards, and window/door trim.
- Any/all replaced exterior trim elements (i. e. window & door trim, corner boards, eave soffit & fascia, crown moldings, etc.) to be restored to the original profile and dimension as determined by any/all existing, original trim and/or shadow lines following the removal of the aluminum siding.
- Install new Boral crown molding in the gables to match existing, original wood molding.
- Install new soffit and fascia in all overhangs.
- Trim color to be "Navajo Beige."

Repair/Replace Gutters & Downspouts

- Examine all existing, metal, ogee (k-style) gutters on the house and make any repairs and/or replace the existing gutter system on all elevations with new metal, ogee (k-style) gutters.
- Install new, corrugated metal downspouts in the appropriate locations to assure proper drainage.
- Examine the existing storm water drainage system for soundness and proper function. Make any/all necessary repairs to the existing storm sewer tile system to assure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties. If deemed necessary, install a French drain system or similar, appropriate drainage system in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.

• **HR-19-10-013**

652-656 Oakwood Avenue

Old Oaks Historic District

F. Michael Curley (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application HR-19-10-013, 652-656 Oakwood Avenue, Oaks Historic District, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

Repair Box Gutters

- Examine all box gutters on the two-family dwelling, and make any repairs and/or replace the existing box gutter system on all elevations with new materials of appropriate dimension and profile.
- Reline with new copper, terne metal, galvanized metal, or E. P. D. M. rubber in accordance with industry standards, manufacturer's specifications, and Columbus Building Codes.
- Install new, round, galvanized metal downspouts in the appropriate locations to assure proper drainage.
- Examine the existing storm water drainage system for soundness and proper function. Make any/all necessary repairs to the existing storm sewer tile system to assure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties. If deemed necessary, install a French drain system or similar, appropriate drainage system in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.

Soffit & Fascia Repair:

- Repair and or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood soffits and fascia on all elevations, as needed,
- New soffit to be Georgia-Pacific Ply-Bead, Traditional, or similar.
- New fascia to be wood, with molding, to match existing, like-for-like.

Satellite Dishes

- Remove the two (2) existing satellite dishes on the front porch roof.

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the brick, two-family dwelling for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Paint color chips for finish coat are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of the paint.
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., exterior brick walls, stone window/door sills and lintels, brick porch railings) is to remain unpainted.**
- **The stone window sills and lintels and the stone coping on the front porch that have been previously painted are to be left as is, to have the paint removed, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted stone as closely as possible, in consultation with Historic Preservation Office staff.**
- Paint color chips for any previously painted masonry are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of paint.

Landscape

- Remove all vines from all exterior walls. Cut vines at ground level and remove roots. Allow existing vines on walls to die before pulling away from the brick walls, to avoid damage to brick and mortar.
- Remove all invasive brush and vines in rear and side yard, as needed.

NOTE: This two-family dwelling is currently vacant.

- **HR-19-10-014**

611 Oakwood Avenue

Old Oaks Historic District

F. Michael Curley (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application HR-19-10-014, 611 Oakwood Avenue, Oaks Historic District, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

Repair Box Gutters

- Examine all box gutters on the single-family dwelling, and make any repairs and/or replace the existing box gutter system on all elevations with new materials of appropriate dimension and profile.
- Reline with new copper, terne metal, galvanized metal, or E. P. D. M. rubber in accordance with industry standards, manufacturer's specifications, and Columbus Building Codes.
- Install new, round, galvanized metal downspouts in the appropriate locations to assure proper drainage.
- Examine the existing storm water drainage system for soundness and proper function. Make any/all necessary repairs to the existing storm sewer tile system to assure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties. If deemed necessary, install a French drain system or similar, appropriate drainage system in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.

Soffit & Fascia Repair:

- Repair and or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood soffits and fascia on all elevations, as needed,
- New soffit to be Georgia-Pacific Ply-Bead, Traditional, or similar.
- New fascia to be wood, with molding, to match existing, like-for-like.

Exterior Painting/Siding Repair

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements and cedar shake siding, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the frame, single-family dwelling for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Paint color chips for finish coat are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final

review and approval, prior to application of the paint.

- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., stone foundation) is to remain unpainted.**

Repair Windows & Doors

- Examine all windows on all elevations and make all necessary repairs to insure proper operation of upper and lower sashes.
- Any/all original wood windows are to be repaired in accordance with industry standards for wood windows.
- Repair all double-hung, wood windows as needed with new materials of exact same dimension and profile; like-for-like.
- Repair any/all existing doors, as needed.
- Removal and/or replacement of any existing doors and windows requires a window schedule and product cut sheets for approval by Historic Preservation Office staff, prior to installation.

Porch Rehabilitation

- Remove any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing tongue and groove, wooden porch flooring.
- Repair and/or replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing floor joists with new wooden floor joists of the appropriate dimension and in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.
- It is recommended that all new, tongue and groove, porch flooring be primed on all sides with porch floor enamel thinned with the appropriate material according to manufacturers' specifications prior to installation in order to extend its useful life.
- Install new, tongue and groove wooden, porch flooring.
- Following installation of the new, wooden flooring, apply no less than one (1), complete, finish coat of the same exterior porch floor enamel thinned with the appropriate material according to manufacturers' specifications; paint color chip to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.
- Restore the front porch columns and privacy railing, as needed, with like material of exact same dimension and profile as the existing, original, front porch columns and privacy railing; like-for-like.

Repair Concrete Block Foundation

- Remove any/all damaged concrete block and replace with concrete block that matches the original material in size, shape, color, and texture.
- Moisten surface with water and solid point with mortar of matching color, texture, hardness, and joint profile. New mortar must be softer than the masonry, and no harder than the historic mortar, to allow for expansion and contraction of the masonry. Original mortar mix was composed of 1 part lime to 2 parts sand. White portland cement may be substituted for up to (but no more than) 20 percent of the lime content. (The owner is advised to use the approved 12 parts sand-4 parts lime-1 part white portland cement formula approved by the National Trust For Historic Preservation. Please refer to Preservation Brief 2- "Repointing Mortar in Historic Masonry Buildings" <http://www.nps.gov/tps/how-to-preserve/briefs/2-repoint-mortar-joints.htm>).

Landscape

- Remove all invasive brush and vines in front, rear and side yard, as needed.

Remove Existing Sidewalks and Install New Sidewalks

- Remove any/all damaged and deteriorated, concrete public and service sidewalks and concrete porch and service steps, as needed, and dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Install new concrete in the same location and of the same dimension, as needed.
- All work to be in accordance with industry standards and all applicable City Building Codes.
- Maintain any/all existing sandstone curbs, and repair, as needed, in accordance with all applicable industry standards, and/or replace with like sandstone curbing.

NOTE: This single-family dwelling is currently vacant.

• **HR-19-10-019**

726 South Champion Avenue

Old Oaks Historic District

Crispin Alvarez (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application HR-19-10-019, 726 South Champion Avenue, Oaks Historic District, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

Rebuild Front Elevation Dormer

- Rebuild the front elevation dormer, per the submitted drawings.
- Shingles in dormer gable to be octagonal, to match the existing shingle pattern on the two, existing front elevation dormers.
- Molding on the cornice and raking cornice of the new dormer to match the existing molding on the two, existing front elevation dormers.
- Window opening on new dormer to be fixed, tempered glass.

Note: Original dormer was removed, and was to be rebuilt by the previous owner (see COA#17-10-17/October 19, 2017).

• **HR-19-10-021**

1166 Bryden Road

Bryden Road Historic District

Fred & Kate Hutchison (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application HR-19-10-021, 1166 Bryden Road, Bryden Road Historic District, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

Replace Siding & Exterior Painting

- Remove all deteriorated wood siding and wood trim on the two-story, rear frame section of the brick house, per the submitted photographs. Install building wrap, as needed.
- Install new wood siding and new wood trim to match the dimensions, profile, and reveal of existing siding and trim, per the submitted drawings.
- Install new flashing at windows, as needed, to match existing.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the two-story, rear frame section for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Paint colors to be "Stone," "Elephant," and "Slate," to match front porch colors.
- **Unpainted concrete foundation is to remain unpainted.**

Repair Windows

- Examine all windows on the two-story, rear frame section of the brick house, and make all necessary repairs to insure proper operation of upper and lower sashes.
- Any/all original wood windows are to be repaired in accordance with industry standards for wood windows.
- Repair all double-hung, wood windows as needed with new materials of exact same dimension and profile; like-for-like.

X. OLD BUSINESS

• **HR-19-10-025**

1822 Bryden Road

Bryden Road Historic District

Kevin Sarich (Applicant/Owner)

Following presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.

Approve Application HR-19-10-025, 1822 Bryden Road, Bryden Road Historic District, as modified, with any/all clarifications noted:

Install New Garage Windows

- Remove the existing glass block in the two (2) garage window openings, which replaced steel six-light windows.
- Install new, six-light Marvin Elevate (formerly Marvin Integrity Wood Ultrex) stationary casement windows

Historic Resources Commission - Minutes

October 17, 2019

15

to fit original openings, per the submitted window schedule.

MOTION:Gibboney/McCabe (5-0-0) APPROVED

XI. NEW BUSINESS

- Public Service to hold public meeting in regard to street/curb/sidewalk improvements in Old Oaks Historic District.
- Central Community House, 1150 E. Main Street, October 15, 2019, 6 p.m.
- Public Service to present to the HRC at an upcoming hearing.

XII. ADJOURN